

## **Pay Benchmarking Summary: DSIFCA**

In May 2022, Cornwall Council were commissioned by DSIFCA (via Chief Officer, Mat Mander) to complete the following:

- Evaluation of proposed jobs in line with the GLPC job evaluation scheme
- Development of a job evaluation points to grade matrix once the roles were evaluated
- Pay Benchmarking around proposed pay structure, including implementation advice

This report focuses on the pay benchmarking exercise which has been undertaken following the conclusion of the job evaluation process (including appeals).

- Appendix 1 - Role summary by Job Evaluation score and new grade and the final agreed points to grade matrix.
- Appendix 2 – summary information from DSIFCA relating to 2011 points to grade on DCC pay scale
- Appendix 3 (spreadsheet) - Raw data referred to in the summary tables in the main report

### **Assumptions:**

The assumptions made were:

- DSIFCA would provide their current pay data
- DSIFCA would share any pay benchmarking data already collected
- Cornwall Council would use historic pay benchmarking data (from 2019/20) for the remaining IFCA's and national pay awards from 2020, 2021 and 2022 would be applied
- There is no additional funding in the budget
- Increment points (for pay structure options 1 and 2) and pay values are those used by Devon County Council (DCC) after the 2022 pay award has been applied
- DSIFCA want to establish how the new JE points to grade would reflect when compared to the 2011 JE points to grade created by DCC (but using current pay increments and values)
- DSIFCA want to establish how far away from a market median position they are for the pay range minimum and maximum for each of the existing roles in Appendix 1
- No enhancements have been applied to any pay values

### **Design Considerations**

Key principles of designing a pay structure are:

- a. Useful to know desired market position (median, above/below median) but this may be constrained by affordability
- b. Unless a compelling reason a common market position would be adopted across the pay structure
- c. Need to determine whether roles need to be benchmarked against the local or national market (this can be differentiated for different groups of roles)
- d. Consideration of moving to the desired position over time through a phased implementation if costs are prohibitive

For the purposes of this work we have not been asked to design any implementation plan so item d above has not been considered. DSIFCA currently adopt a common market position across the pay structure, using other IFCAs as a benchmarking tool.

Pay Structure Options considered:

- Scenario 1: Map existing increment points (and associated pay) to the new JE points to Grade
- Scenario 2: Map new JE points to Grade structure to the 2011 DCC points to increment list. This would be based on the 2022 value of those increments.
- Scenario 3: Determine market median pay ranges for each role

Scenario 1: Status Quo

This option maps the new JE points to grade matrix to the existing DCC increment ranges. There is no cost involved as based on the JE scores for each role, individual roles have remained in the same groups as prior to the evaluation was completed.

This option would enable the 6 individual grades and associated increment points to be mapped across with no detrimental impact to staff, and no additional costs to DSIFCA based on current staffing levels.

Table 1 below shows the summary for each role based on current salary information provided:

Grade	JE Points Range	SCP	DCC SCP	FTE Salary	Hourly Rate
1	Under 425	1	4	£ 21,189	£ 10.98
1		2	5	£ 21,575	£ 11.18
1		3	6	£ 21,968	£ 11.39
2	425 - 499	1	16	£ 26,357	£ 13.66
2		2	18	£ 27,344	£ 14.17
2		3	19	£ 27,852	£ 14.44
2		4	21	£ 28,900	£ 14.98
2		5	22	£ 29,439	£ 15.26
3	500 - 599	1	24	£ 31,099	£ 16.12
3		2	25	£ 32,020	£ 16.60
3		3	26	£ 32,909	£ 17.06
3		4	27	£ 33,820	£ 17.53
3		5	28	£ 34,723	£ 18.00
4	600 - 649	1	29	£ 35,411	£ 18.35
4		2	30	£ 36,298	£ 18.81
4		3	31	£ 37,261	£ 19.31
4		4	32	£ 38,296	£ 19.85
4		5	33	£ 39,493	£ 20.47
5	650 - 720	1	40	£ 46,549	£ 24.13
5		2	41	£ 47,573	£ 24.66
5		3	42	£ 48,587	£ 25.18
5		4	43	£ 49,590	£ 25.70
5		5	44	£ 50,603	£ 26.23
6	720+	1	L8	£ 59,597	£ 30.88

## Scenario 2: Comparison to 2011 points to increment

This option maps the new JE points to grade matrix to the 2011 DCC increment ranges.

In 2019, DCC moved to the new NJC pay spine which radically changed the way the pay increments were structured.

To complete this element of the benchmarking exercise I had to:

- Locate the 2009 NJC pay spine and increment values and map these (there were no pay awards after that until 2013)
- Locate the 2018-2019 NJC pay spine and map the 2018 data to the 2009 data
  - This also required mapping the points used by DCC above the NJC spine
- Map the 2018 data to the new pay structure and increments from 1 April 2019
- Correlate the 2019 data to the current DCC pay structure and leadership spine
- Map the new points to grade and old increment ranges for JE points on the email provided by DSIFCA
- Update with the new 2022 pay information

All of the above stages also required me to add the pay values for the increment points used by DCC above the NJC spine – details can be seen in the raw data in Appendix 3

Table 2 below shows the summary for each role based on scenario 2:

Grade	JE Points Range	DCC SCP in 2011	Map to equivalent DCC Increment in 2022	Min £	Max £
1	Under 425	6 to 28	1 to 22	£ 20,258	£ 29,439
2	425 - 499	29 to 37	24 to 31	£ 31,099	£ 37,261
3	500 - 599	38 to 47	32 to 41	£ 38,296	£ 41,496
4	600 - 649	47 to 58	41 to 44	£ 47,573	£ 50,603
5	650 - 720	59 to 69	L9 and L8	£ 53,260	£ 59,597
6	720+	70 +	L7	£ 66,161	N/A

Table 3 shows the current salary ranges between Scenario 1 (status quo) and their values when compared to Scenario 2, using the 2011 increment point ranges.

GRADE	Difference between Scenario 1 and 2			
	Pay Range Min	Pay Range Min %	Pay Range Max	Pay Range Max %
6	-£ 10,564	-19.00%	-£ 10,564	-19.00%
5	-£ 6,711	-14.42%	-£ 8,994	-17.77%
4	-£ 12,162	-34.35%	-£ 11,110	-28.13%
3	-£ 7,197	-23.14%	-£ 6,773	-19.51%
2	-£ 4,742	-17.99%	-£ 7,822	-26.57%
1	£ 931	4.39%	-£ 7,471	-34.01%
Total	-£ 6,741	-17.42%	-£ 8,789	-24.17%

Table 3 shows that apart from Grade 1 (where the proposed pay range would in fact start lower than the existing arrangements), Grades 2 to 6 pay range minimums would need to move significantly to mirror the 2011 increment point ranges. For the roles of Deputy Chief and Chief Officer, the author was unsure whether this proposal would even be possible based on now knowing the links with the DCC structure and senior reporting lines.

All pay range maximums would need to increase significantly to accommodate this scenario.

Based on the current post holders, this would cost between £69k (min) and £89k (max) to implement plus any oncosts (typically around 26%).

### Scenario 3: Market median position

For this part of the benchmarking the pay data provided by DSIFCA was used, plus updated data sourced by Cornwall Council for a previous pay benchmarking exercise for another IFCA in 2020.

Data was also sourced from some external agencies (although live vacancies were challenging to locate for many roles)

External data was taken from job adverts for DEFRA (Principal Policy Advisor and Marine Development Officer roles), Indeed.co.uk (for Finance and Admin Manager roles across the DSIFCA area) and the Environment Agency (Environment and Enforcement Officers and their Senior equivalents).

The data including DSIFCA data was then averaged to obtain a market median position for the bottom and the top of the pay range for each active DSIFCA role.

Table 4 shows the summary for each role based on the market median pay ranges in scenario 3:

<b>JE Code</b>	<b>Role title</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>GRADE</b>	<b>Median Min</b>	<b>Median Max</b>
DSIFCA1	Chief Officer	736	6	£ 56,608	£ 64,752
DSIFCA2	Deputy Chief Officer	678	5	£ 43,895	£ 51,157
DSIFCA3	Principal Policy Officer	604	4	£ 34,688	£ 40,152
DSIFCA4	Senior Environment Officer	592	3	£ 31,929	£ 39,301
DSIFCA5	Senior Enforcement Officer	550	3	£ 31,929	£ 39,301
DSIFCA6	Finance Admin Manager	540	3	£ 29,630	£ 35,851
DSIFCA7	Environment Officer	486	2	£ 26,523	£ 31,609
DSIFCA8	Enforcement Officer Intel	462	2	£ 26,523	£ 31,609
DSIFCA9	Enforcement Officer	450	2	£ 26,523	£ 31,609
DSIFCA10	Marine Development Officer	428	2	£ 25,131	£ 29,639
	No roles	under 425	1		

This was then compared to the status quo in scenario 1 to determine which roles are:

- More than 2% above market median (shaded green)
- Between 2% above and below the market median position (shaded apricot)
- 2% or more below the market median position (shaded pink)

Table 5: Difference from market median (pay range min and max) for each role:

				Difference from Market Median			
JE Code	Role title	TOTAL	GRADE	Pay Range Min	Pay Range Min %	Pay Range Max	Pay Range Max %
DSIFCA1	Chief Officer	736	6	-£ 1,011	-1.82%	-£ 9,155	-16.47%
DSIFCA2	Deputy Chief Officer	678	5	£ 2,654	5.70%	-£ 554	-1.10%
DSIFCA3	Principal Policy Officer	604	4	£ 723	2.04%	-£ 659	-1.67%
DSIFCA4	Senior Environment Officer	592	3	-£ 830	-2.67%	-£ 4,578	-13.19%
DSIFCA5	Senior Enforcement Officer	550	3	-£ 830	-2.67%	-£ 4,578	-13.19%
DSIFCA6	Finance Admin Manager	540	3	£ 1,469	4.72%	-£ 1,128	-3.25%
DSIFCA7	Environment Officer	486	2	-£ 166	-0.63%	-£ 2,170	-7.37%
DSIFCA8	Enforcement Officer Intel	462	2	-£ 166	-0.63%	-£ 2,170	-7.37%
DSIFCA9	Enforcement Officer	450	2	-£ 166	-0.63%	-£ 2,170	-7.37%
DSIFCA10	Marine Development Officer	428	2	£ 1,226	4.65%	-£ 200	-0.68%
	No roles	under 425	1	£ 931	4.39%	£ 1,710	7.78%

It is clear from table 5 that the pay range minimum of 5 roles (Deputy Chief Officer, Principal Policy Officer, Finance & Admin Manager, Marine Development Officer and Grade 1 – which has no active roles) and the pay range maximum for Grade 1 are above market median.

Only 2 roles (Senior Environment and Senior Enforcement Officers) have a starting salary more than 2% from the market median position, however that is still less than 3% different and could be considered to be a broadly market median position.

Therefore, based on this information the starting increment points in each grade, based on the salaries in Scenario 1 appear to be broadly similar to, or slightly higher than the market median for each role.

Grade 1's pay range maximum in Scenario 1 is above the market median position – however for the purpose of this exercise we have kept both values at £20,258 - which is the current bottom of the NJC pay spine. This is because there are no active post holders.

3 of the remaining roles could be considered to have a pay range maximum broadly in line with market median (Marine Development Officer, Deputy Chief Officer and Principal Policy Officer). However, not all IFCA's have these roles so the averages are based on less data, albeit it is still an average.

The remaining roles show some significant disparity from the median position for the roles when compared to the other IFCA's and where appropriate, external agencies with similar jobs. If DSIFCA did want to move to a market median position for all roles, based on the current post holders this would cost an additional £3,833 (pay range minimum) and £25.5k (at the pay range maximum) plus any oncosts. The total cost would be dependent on what increment points were within each grade and if these remained the same as in scenario 1.

#### **Other considerations:**

DSIFCA will need to consider whether they have any additional funding to support an increase in costs. If a decision to consider either scenario 2 or 3 moves forward, it is important to note that costs would increase further with the increase to pay points once the national pay award for 2023 is confirmed.

## Appendix 1: DSIFCA Confirmed Job Evaluation Scores and Points to Grade Matrix

### Job Evaluation Scores & Grade by Role

JE Code	Role title	TOTAL	GRADE
DSIFCA1	Chief Officer	736	6
DSIFCA2	Deputy Chief Officer	678	5
DSIFCA3	Principal Policy Officer	604	4
DSIFCA4	Senior Environment Officer	592	3
DSIFCA5	Senior Enforcement Officer	550	3
DSIFCA6	Finance Admin Manager	540	3
DSIFCA7	Environment Officer	486	2
DSIFCA8	Enforcement Officer Intel	462	2
DSIFCA9	Enforcement Officer	450	2
DSIFCA10	Marine Development Officer	428	2

### Points to Grade Matrix

Grade	Min JE Points	Max JE Points
Grade 6	720+	
Grade 5	650	720
Grade 4	600	649
Grade 3	500	599
Grade 2	425	499
Grade 1	Under 425	

## Appendix 2: Devon County Council Pay scales and JE points range from 2011

JE Points range	SCPT	Proposed Salary Scale Lowest Increment	SCPT	Proposed Salary Scale Top Increment
<=200	4	12,145	10	13,874
201-225	11	14,733	13	15,444
226-275	14	15,725	17	16,830
276-325	18	17,161	21	19,126
326-375	22	19,621	25	21,519
376-425	26	22,221	28	23,708
426-475	29	24,646	34	28,636
476-525	35	29,236	39	32,800
526-575	40	33,661	44	37,200
576-625	45	38,042	50	42,502
626-675	56	42,840	60	45,470
676-725	61	46,415	65	51,083
726-775	66	51,741	70	56,897
776-825	71	57,007	75	62,692
826+	76	67,961	80	74,755