

Job Evaluation Report

Officers' Recommendation

- 1. That Members agree that the Governance Working Group undertakes a review of the Officers' financial package and reports back to the Full Authority meeting to be held on 21st September 2023.**

Background

An Officers' paper to the Authority in July 2021 set out organisational weakness and staffing issues including the difficulty to retain staff. D&S IFCA's retention of staff over the last four years has been a concern for Members and Officers. Since March 2019, 11 Officers have resigned out of team of 15, with levels of pay often one of the main reasons for their decision to leave. Included in the 2021 paper was the need to undertake a Job Evaluation of the roles undertaken by Officers. Members supported the paper and agreed to undertake a Job Evaluation.

As part of D&S IFCA's Mental Health Policy, staff surveys and confidential vox box feedback over the last 18 months, staff have expressed their concerns over their high workloads and poor pay which is impacting on their wellbeing and mental health.

The previous Job Evaluation in 2011, conducted by Devon County Council, had been conducted during the transfer of Officers (Transfer of Undertakings (Protection of Employment)) from Devon Sea Fisheries Committee to D&S IFCA. The job descriptions in 2010 reflected the duties of the Sea Fisheries Committee not the much broader duties set out in the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009. The Job Evaluation was undertaken in 2022 to recognise the fact that the job descriptions needed updating to reflect the changes and also the increased level of work expected of Officers.

Cornwall's HR Team were commissioned in May 2022 to complete the following:

- Evaluation of jobs in line with the GLPC job evaluation scheme
- Development of a job evaluation points to grade matrix once the roles were evaluated
- Pay Benchmarking around proposed pay structure, including implementation advice

Job Evaluation Process

The Human Resources (HR) department with Cornwall County Council were identified as the best option to undertake the 2022/2023 Job Evaluation process. The two officers tasked with delivering the process were both experienced in Job Evaluation using the Greater London Provincial Council Scheme and importantly had recently completed a Job Evaluation for North Eastern IFCA and had previously conducted an evaluation for Cornwall IFCA.

The latest Job Evaluation and the previous one carried out by D&S IFCA in 2011 both used the same Greater London Provincial Council (GLPC) Job Evaluation Scheme 2000. This evaluation process has been adopted by Devon County Council as cited in the 2022-2023 Pay Policy Statement and is widely used by Local Authorities and other organisations.

The Cornwall County Council's HR team worked with the Chief Officer to create new draft Job Profiles and Role Information Questionnaires for each of the ten different types of roles that exist at D&S IFCA. The existing Job Descriptions for posts were used for reference but the new documents recognise the roles and responsibilities of Officers to deliver D&S IFCA's Statutory duties in 2022/23. The draft Job Profiles and Role Information Questionnaires were much more detailed than the existing Job Descriptions.

Once the HR Team and the Chief Officer were satisfied the draft Job Profiles and Role Information Questionnaires were sufficiently developed to undertake the Job Evaluation, the documents were shared with Officers for comment and suggested amendments. The main issue raised by Officers was that the documents did not reflect the additional work that was delivered due to their skills and experience. The documents could only reflect the minimum requirements and roles and responsibilities for a new entrant to the post.

Once the draft documents were agreed, the HR team undertook the assessment of the ten roles and produced the provisional scoring across 12 criteria and an overall score and grade for each post. Officers were able to appeal the content of the final versions of the Job Profiles and Role Information Questionnaires. The scoring did not provide Officers with an indication of how their scores translated to pay. Six appeals were considered by the HR team, three were successful and three were not.

Once the appeals were completed, the final Job Profiles and Role Information Questionnaires were confirmed and a final points to grade matrix was provided. The HR team then undertook the pay benchmarking exercise.

Outcomes of the Evaluation

1. D&S IFCA and its Officers now have comprehensive Job Profiles and Role Information Questionnaires. The documents clearly set out each Officers' role and responsibilities and identify the line manager structure of the organisation and delegation of duties across the team.
2. Cornwall HR has produced a report that has compared roles and remuneration in different ways – direct comparisons to NJC pay scales/points from 2011 and an attempt to compare across similar organisations and comparable roles.
3. All comparable roles scored significantly higher in the 2022 process as compared to 2011, as shown in Table 1. This is despite the process not catering for the additional skills and abilities that experienced Officers provide. The scoring is based on a standpoint of minimum requirements for each role and does not reflect the additional skills and abilities that experienced Officers provide.
4. The Job Evaluation did not identify any role that should move up or down the existing grade structure. To maintain the existing six salary grades, the scoring bands had to be increased significantly to maintain the existing management structure.
5. Officers are aware that due to the on-going financial constraints, remuneration based on the findings are unlikely. This has been recognised and discussed by staff, who

have reported low morale and difficulties remaining motivated to undertake their respective roles without financial recognition of the level of work they undertake.

6. Officers are aware of D&S IFCA's financial constraints, but have asked that a reduction in hours, which would effectively increase hourly rates of pay and improve their work/life balance, becomes a potential option for consideration by the Authority. Officers feel that the reduction in their weekly committed hours, would potentially improve their mental health and productivity, which would in turn lead to the same service being delivered in less time.

Findings of the Evaluation & Benchmarking Exercise

Table 1, below, shows the point scores awarded to each of the 10 different roles at D&S IFCA (2022) and how the points scored for each role has increased compared to 2011. It also demonstrates the points ranges required to position each role in a grade band.

Table 1

JE Code	Role title	2022 Scoring		2022		2011 Scoring		2011	
		TOTAL	GRADE	Min JE Points	Max JE Points	TOTAL	GRADE	Min JE Points	Max JE Points
DSIFCA1	Chief Officer	736	6	720		702	6	676	725
DSIFCA2	Deputy Chief Officer	678	5	650	720	588	5	576	625
DSIFCA3	Principal Policy Officer	604	4	600	649	522	4	476	525
DSIFCA4	Senior Environment Officer	592	3	500	599	458	3	426	475
DSIFCA5	Senior Enforcement Officer	550	3	500	599	466	3	426	475
DSIFCA6	Finance Admin Manager	540	3	500	599	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
DSIFCA7	Environment Officer	486	2	425	499	418	2	376	425
DSIFCA8	Enforcement Officer Intel	462	2	425	499	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
DSIFCA9	Enforcement Officer	450	2	425	499	362	2	376	425
DSIFCA10	Marine Development Officer	428	2	425	499	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	No post		1	Under 425		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

The HR team mapped the 2022 scoring to the grade matrix used in the 2011 Job Evaluation. In 2019, the pay structure adopted by Devon County Council changed and this is reflected in the Table 2 below.

Table 2

Grade	JE Points Range	DCC SCP in 2011	Map to equivalent DCC Increment in 2022	Min £	Max £
1	Under 425	6 to 28	1 to 22	£ 20,258	£ 29,439
2	425 - 499	29 to 37	24 to 31	£31,099	£37,261
3	500 - 599	38 to 47	32 to 41	£38,296	£41,496
4	600 - 649	47 to 58	41 to 44	£47,573	£50,603
5	650 - 720	59 to 69	L9 and L8	£53,260	£59,597
6	720+	70 +	L7	£66,161	N/A

Table 3

Difference between 2022 pay and 2011 pay using 2011 Spinal Points and Grades							
Grade	2022 JE Points Range	Equivalent DCC Spinal Points for Grade in 2011	Map 2011 Spinal Points to 2022 Grade	Pay Range difference between 2022 and 2011 on lowest Spinal Point in Grade	Pay Range Min % difference between 2022 and 2011	Pay Range Max difference between 2022 and 2011 on highest Spinal Point in Grade	Pay Range Max % difference between 2022 and 2011
6	720+	70+	L7	-£10,564	-19.00	-£10,564	-19.00
5	650-720	59 to 69	L9 and L8	-£6,711	-14.42	-£8,994	-17.77
4	600-649	47 to 58	41 to 44	-£12,162	-34.35	-£11,110	-28.13
3	500-599	38 to 47	32 to 41	-£7,179	-23.14	-£6,773	-19.51
2	425-499	29 to 37	24 to 31	-£4,742	-17.99	-£7,822	-26.57
1	Under 425	6 to 28	1 to 22	£931	4.39	-£7,471	-24.17

Table 3 shows that Grades 2 to 6 pay would need to increase significantly to mirror the 2011 grades for the same GLPC point scoring.

The HR Team also looked at the market median position. This used external data from job adverts for DEFRA, Environment Agency, various Finance and Administration managers roles and IFCAs. Table 4 shows that when compared to similar roles across different organisations some roles have a marginally higher starting salary, but all roles have a maximum range below the median.

Table 4

JE Code	Role Title	Total Points	Grade	Difference from Market Median			
				Pay Range Min	Pay Range Min%	Pay Range Max	Pay Range Max%
DSIFCA1	Chief Officer	736	6	-£11,011	-1.82	-£9,155	-16.47
DSIFCA2	Deputy Chief Officer	678	5	£2,654	5.70	-£544	-1.10
DSIFCA3	Principal Policy Officer	604	4	£723	2.04	-£659	-1.67
DSIFCA4	Senior Environment Officer	592	3	-£830	-2.67	-£4,578	-13.19
DSIFCA5	Senior Enforcement Officer	550	3	-£830	-2.67	-£4,578	-13.19
DSIFCA6	Finance Admin Manager	540	3	£1,469	4.72	-£1,128	-3.25
DSIFCA7	Environment Officer	486	2	-£166	-0.63	-£2,170	-7.37
DSIFCA8	Enforcement Officer Intel	462	2	-£166	-0.63	-£2,170	-7.37
DSIFCA9	Enforcement Officer	450	2	-£166	-0.63	-£2,170	-7.37
DSIFCA10	Marine Development Officer	428	2	£1,226	4.65	-£200	-0.68
	No roles	Under 425	1	£931	4.39	£1,710	7.78

The HR Team recognised that for the DCO, PPO and MDO roles there was less available data to undertake the assessment. It was also recognised that the demands of similarly titled roles will vary significantly across IFCAs. Comparing roles that have scored similar points using the GLPC scheme is a more accurate way to determine variation in pay across different organisations.

Considerations

From the start of the job evaluation process the Chief Officer made it clear to Officers that the likelihood of increasing salaries (possibly to align with Table 2 or 4) was very low due to D&S IFCA's financial crisis. Understandably from the Officers' point of view this is of little comfort when the Job Evaluation process has identified that Officers are paid less than their colleagues in other IFCAs and organisations and that public pay has not kept pace with inflation for many years.

The Officers' paper in 2021 identified the risk to D&S IFCA from losing highly trained and capable team members and poor remuneration had been cited in most of the exit interviews.

The Senior Management Team are very concerned that if the Authority do nothing to explore how the findings of the Job Evaluation translate into the financial package offered to its employees, Officers will look for alternative employment. The review would provide the opportunity to explore the potential of raising salaries or alternatives such as reducing Officers' annual committed hours and the implications these changes may have for the Authority.

Resignations from the team are always challenging but in D&S IFCA's case, the remaining Officers will likely feel even more demotivated due to a lack of financial recognition of the roles and responsibilities they have. D&S IFCA's Annual Plan for 2023/34 identifies the workstreams for the year and a reduction in Officers will make its delivery even harder to achieve.

The findings of the benchmarking exercise are not surprising given that D&S IFCA's Revenue Budget falls way short of other mainland IFCAs and no other IFCA is projected to have a gap in its finances, anywhere near D&S IFCA's projection of £152,000 in 2024/25.

The Job Evaluation outcome is further evidence that D&S IFCA's funding needs to be increased significantly to avoid creating additional barriers to the organisation delivering its Statutory Duties.

Members are asked to consider whether the Governance Working Group undertakes a review of the Officers' financial package and report back to the September Full Authority meeting.

Background Papers

- Agenda Item 12 June 2021 - Organisational Weakness & Staffing Issues

(All are available within Section B of the [D&S IFCA Website Resource Library](#))